

# EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

2004



2009

---

*Delegation to the EU-Kazakhstan, EU-Kyrgyzstan and EU-Uzbekistan Parliamentary Cooperation Committees, and for relations with Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Mongolia*

DCAS\_PV (2008) 09/11

## **MINUTES**

of the meeting of 11 September 2008, 09h00-10h00

### **Brussels**

1. Adoption of the draft agenda (PE 409.222)
2. Adoption of minutes of the meeting on 26 February 2008 (PE 401.216)
3. Announcements by the Chair
4. Exchange of views with H.E. Mr Pierre Morel, EU Special representative for Central Asia and Mr Hugues Mingarelli, Deputy Director General of DG RELEX of the European Commission
5. Preparations for the 3rd EU-Tajikistan IPM, Dushanbe, 29 September to 2 October 2008
6. Preparations for the 6th EU-Kyrgyzstan PCC, Bishkek, w/c 27 October 2008
7. Preparations for the 7th EU-Uzbekistan PCC, Brussels, 4 to 5 November 2008
8. Any other business
9. Date and place of next meeting

Mrs JUKNEVIČIENĖ opened the meeting at 09.00hrs.

**1. Adoption of draft agenda (PE 409.222)**

The draft agenda was adopted without amendment.

**2. Adoption of minutes of the meeting on 26 February 2008 (PE 401.216)**

The minutes were adopted without amendment.

**3. Announcements by the Chair**

The Chair welcomed all those present

**4. Exchange of views with H.E. Mr Pierre Morel, EU Special representative for Central Asia and Mr Hugues Mingarelli, Deputy Director General of DG RELEX of the European Commission**

Mr Mingarelli stated that EU-Central Asia relations had taken a qualitative leap forward in the last 18 months with the entry into force of a new European Strategy. In the past the region had been somewhat neglected. There was now a real political dialogue with the five countries, including human rights, initiatives in areas such as education and tackling trafficking in human beings, the fight against terrorism and dealing with environmental degradation. It was essential to ratify the Interim Trade Agreement and the Partnership and Cooperation Agreement (PCA) with Turkmenistan to allow the EU to expand its relationship. The 1989 Agreement which had been signed with the Soviet Union and formed the basis of the current relationship with Turkmenistan, did not reflect current realities and restricted what the EU could do with the country.

He was aware of the reservations of some MEPs about deepening the relationship with Turkmenistan, particularly as there were serious concerns over human rights in the country. Nevertheless, the Commission considered that the EU would be in a better position to enter into a dialogue on such issues if a PCA were in place. Since the coming to power of President Berdymukhamedov there had been a much more frank dialogue between the EU and Turkmenistan. There had been some real opening by Ashgabat, although it was admittedly limited. Europa House was very active in Turkmenistan. Implementing the agreement would enable the EU to expand the dialogue and it was essential to have a real contractual basis for the relationship.

Mr Morel argued that it would be wrong to believe that the EU could have any impact if it deprived its relationship of a legal basis. Much had been done but it was essential to have the tools to develop the relationship. He referred to the international context and that Turkmenistan was a neighbour of Afghanistan where there were major concerns over the drugs trade. Turkmenistan, with the support of the United Nations, was setting up a drugs agency for the first time. Turkmenistan had also stopped the transfer of sensitive materials to its neighbour Iran and the two countries had difficult economic relations. The crisis in Georgia highlighted the importance of the southern corridor for gas exports. It was essential to support Turkmenistan's policy of asserting itself and to develop a multi-

vectoral foreign policy that was open to the outside world. The new President had entered a 30 year agreement on gas deliveries with China. He stressed that formal agreements with Turkmenistan would make it easier to cooperate with it. He referred to the UN regional preventative diplomacy centre in Ashgabat headed by the former OSCE representative in Tashkent. There was a structured dialogue on human rights with Turkmenistan in June 2008 in which the discussions were substantive. A Memorandum of Agreement on energy was signed recently by the Commission.

Mrs Jeggle welcomed active dialogue with all the countries of the region and believed it was essential to have the basis to carry this out so that there was no repetition of the events in Georgia. She welcomed the statements of the two speakers.

Mr Gawronski stressed that there were arguments for and against the approach of increased engagement with Turkmenistan. He welcomed the positive changes of the Turkmen leadership. He asked about the current developments of the Nabucco pipeline.

Mrs Lyubcheva referred to the good relations between Bulgaria and Central Asian countries. She stressed the need to develop this relationship for all EU countries.

Mrs Ferreira agreed that dialogue was very important and wanted to learn about the results of this dialogue.

Mr Peterle agreed that there was more readiness for dialogue on the part of the Central Asians. He wanted to know how the region viewed the forthcoming Kazakhstan Presidency of the OSCE.

Mrs Juknevičienė thanked the speakers and welcomed the cooperation between Council, Commission and Parliament on Central Asia. She appreciated the focus of the French Presidency on energy issues, noting that Lithuania was totally dependent on Russia for its energy and wanted to learn about the situation of the Nabucco pipeline. She wanted to know what criteria had to be met in agreeing to a PCA. She also referred to the vote in the previous week in the European Parliament on extending the EIB eligibility to Central Asia, with the exception for the moment of Uzbekistan. It was important to clarify the obstacles to speeding up the process of dialogue.

Mr Mingarelli stressed that the impact of the change of leadership in Turkmenistan was immediate and obvious as there was now a willingness to talk about difficult issues. The authorities clearly had a desire to reform the state and he referred in particular to a programme of reform for the health and education sector. The EU needed to respond to this openness.

He accepted that there were major differences of opinion on human rights but believed that there were now more opportunities to discuss these issues, including raising individual cases and proposing amendments to legislation. He agreed that benchmarks were essential, including basic principles for the rules of law, reduction in the number of political prisoners, promoting the freedom of the media and open access for the opposition parties. It was essential to monitor this area.

Any partner country signing a PCA was required to agree to the provisions of the agreement which obliged it respect essential principles of human rights. Each party was permitted to suspend the agreement if it did not consider that the other party was respecting the principles of democracy and the rule of law. Turkmenistan had agreed to these conditions and there was therefore no impediment to signing the PCA

Mr Morel stressed that there was now a more structured dialogue and agenda with a list of individual cases and questions on legislation. It was planned to implement next year's dialogue on a more methodical basis. There was an Institute of Human Rights and

Democracy which was looking at how to implement human rights conventions. President Berdymukhamedov had met President Pöttering and the visit had been very successful and one of Mr Pöttering's staff had subsequently gone to Turkmenistan.

Turkmenistan was a key country for energy supply. It was too simplistic to say that the Nabucco pipeline was dead: experts were convinced of the need for a corridor but accepted that financially it would be more difficult. The original idea was to bring the project into operation by 2013 but now this and other projects would be delayed, apart from the Turkey-Greece-Italy part which might be ready by 2011. Although it was more difficult commercially it was now more important politically. Public authorities would now have to be more involved in the light of the more troubled context in the work of the companies.

Mrs Juknevičienė stressed that any specific questions could be sent in writing to Messrs Morel and Mingarelli. She thanked them for coming to the meeting and underlined that she was open for cooperation.

## **5. Preparations for the 3rd EU-Tajikistan IPM, Dushanbe, 29 September to 2 October 2008**

Mrs Juknevičienė noted that a message had been received that it would not be possible to meet with the members of the Majilis Oli, owing to the heavy organisational demands on them in preparing for Ramadan. She asked the Ambassador Yatimov of Tajikistan to comment.

Mr Yatimov thanked the European Parliament for proposing to send a delegation to Dushanbe. He regretted that the embassy had no more information on the matter. He had sent a letter to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs asking for an explanation of this matter.

Charlotte Adriaen, Chargé d'affaires of the Delegation of the European Commission in Dushanbe, stated that she had heard of the problems the previous day. It appeared that it would be impossible to hold the formal session with the Majilis Oli. She considered that it was very important that the European Parliament should go to Tajikistan. She was sure that with the support of the Commission and the Foreign Minister a valuable visit could be arranged, including meetings with the Minister of Economic and Trade, the Minister of Foreign Affairs, the Minister of Justice and, if possible, the President. She noted that the first structured human rights dialogue would take place on October 31 and the country also stood at a crossroads after a very difficult winter, and there needed to be changes. She was convinced that a full and useful programme could be set up for the delegation.

Mrs Ferreira asked whether it was really essential to have an interparliamentary meeting or whether other meetings would be possible.

Mr Peterle asked for clarification on the situation and stressed that he was keen to meet the parliamentarians.

Mrs Juknevičienė believed that any visit should take place following the traditional approach for such missions. She was sceptical about the value of meetings with NGOs as she understood they were government controlled. She stressed the need to have meetings with parliamentarians and Ministers. At present there were more questions than answers and she wanted her concerns to be addressed. It was not appropriate to go for merely tourism. She invited colleagues to exchange views by email. She asked the Ambassador to establish what the situation was and requested that the Commission Delegation confirm the

meetings. She expected that the situation would be clarified in the following week.

Ambassador Yatimov underlined that the embassy was very keen to organise this "very important" visit.

Mrs Juknevičienė thanked the ambassador and noted that Ramadan was an important and sensitive event.

**6. Preparations for the 6th EU-Kyrgyzstan PCC, Bishkek, w/c 27 October 2008**

There was insufficient time for this item

**7. Preparations for the 7th EU-Uzbekistan PCC, Brussels, 4 to 5 November 2008**

There was insufficient time for this item

**8. Any other business**

There was no other business

**9. Date and place of next meeting**

The next meeting was scheduled to take place in Brussels on 7 October 2008 at 1130hrs.

The meeting closed at 10h00.

**LISTA DE ASISTENCIA/PREZENČNÍ LISTINA/DELTAGERLISTE/ANWESENHEITSLISTE/KOHALOLIJATE  
NIMEKIRI/ KATAΣΤΑΣΗ ΠΑΡΟΝΤΩΝ/RECORD OF ATTENDANCE/LISTE DE PRÉSENCE/ELENCO DI  
PRESENZA/APMEKLĒJUMU REGISTRŠ/DALYVIŲ SĄRAŠAS/JELENLÉTI ÍV/REGISTRU TA'  
ATTENDENZA/PRESENTIELIJST/LISTA OBECNOŠCI/ LISTA DE PRESENÇAS/PREZENČNÁ LISTINA/SEZNAM  
NAVZOČIH/LĀSNĀOLOLISTA/DELTAGARLISTA**

Mesa/Předsednictví/Formandskabet/Vorstand/Juhatus/Προεδρείο/Bureau/Ufficio di presidenza/Prezidijs/Biuras/Elnökség/Prezydium/ Predsednictvo/Predsedstvo/Puheenjohtajisto/Presidiet (*)
Ona Juknevičienė (P), Jas Gawronski (1 VP)
Diputados/Poslanci/Medlemmer/Mitglieder/Parlamendiliikmed/Μέλη/Members/Députés/Deputati/Deputāti/Nariai/Képviselők/ Membri/Leden/Posłowie/Deputados/Jäsenet/Ledamöter
Elisabeth Jeggle, Marusya Ivanova Lyubcheva, Janusz Wojciechowski
Suplentes/Náhradníci/Stedfortrædere/Stellvertreter/Asendusliikmed/Αναπληρωτές/Substitutes/Suppléants/Supplenti/Aizstājēji/ Pavadojantys nariai/Póttagok/Sostituti/Plaatsvervangers/Zastępcy/Membros suplentes/Náhradníci/Namestniki/Varajäsenet/ Suppleanter
Anne Ferreira

178 (2)
183 (3)
Alojz Peterle
46 (6) (Punto del orden del día/Bod pořadu jednání/Punkt på dagsordenen/Tagesordnungspunkt/Päevakorra punkt/Ημερήσια Διάταξη Σημείο/Agenda ítem/Point OJ/Punto all'ordine del giorno/Darba kārtības punkts/Darbotvarkēs punktas/Napirendi pont/Punt Agenda/ Agendapunt/Punkt porządku dziennego/Ponto OD/Bod programu schôdze/Točka UL/Esityslistan kohta/Föredragningslista punkt)

Observadores/Pozorovatelé/Observatører/Beobachter/Vaatlejad/Παρατηρητές/Observers/Observateurs/Osservatori/Novērotāji/ Stebētāji/Megfigyelők/Osservatori/Waarnemers/Obserwatorzy/Observadores/Pozorovatelia/Opazovalci/Tarkkailijat/Observatörer

Por invitación del presidente/Na pozvání předsedy/Efter indbydelse fra formanden/Auf Einladung des Vorsitzenden/Esimehe kutsel/ Με πρόσκληση του Προέδρου/At the invitation of the Chair(wo)man/Sur l'invitation du président/Su invito del presidente/ Pēc priekšsēdētāja uzaicinājuma/Pirmininkui pakvietus/Az elnök meghívására/Fuq stedina tač-'Chairman'/Op uitnodiging van de voorzitter/Na zaproszenie Przewodniczącego/A convite do Presidente/Na pozvanie predsedu/Na povabilo predsednika/ Puheenjohtajan kutsusta/På ordförandens inbjudan

Consejo/Rada/Rådet/Rat/Nōukogu/Συμβούλιο/Council/Conseil/Consiglio/Padome/Taryba/Tanács/Kunsill/Raad/Conselho/Svet/Neuvosto/Rådet (*)	
MOREL (EU Special representative for Central Asia), Anke HEYER	
Comisión/Komise/Kommissionen/Kommission/Euroopa Komisjon/Επιτροπή/Commission/Commissione/Komisija/Bizottság/Kummissjoni/Commissie/Komisja/Comissão/Komisia/Komissio/Kommissionen (*)	
MINGARELLI (Deputy Director General of DG RELEX), HACK, MINA, BYRNE (DG Relex), ADRIAEN (EU DEL Tajikistan),	
Otras instituciones/Ostatní orgány a instituce/Andre institutioner/Andere Organe/Muud institutsioonid/Άλλα θεσμικά όργανα/Other institutions/Autres institutions/Altre istituzioni/Citas iestādes/Kitos institucijos/Más intézmények/Istituzzjonijiet ohra/Andere instellingen/Inne instytucje/Outras Instituições/Iné inštitúcie/Druge institucije/Muut toimielimet/Andra institutioner/organ	

Otros participantes/Ostatní účastníci/Endvidere deltog/Andere Teilnehmer/Muud osalejad/Επίσης Παρόντες/Other participants/Autres participants/Altri partecipanti/Citi klātesošie/Kiti dalyviai/Más résztvevők/Partecipanti ohra/Andere aanwezigen/Inni uczestnicy/Outros participantes/Iní účastníci/Drugi udeleženci/Muut osallistajat/Övriga deltagare	
<p>Levceva (office of the EUSR for Central Asia)</p> <p>Seitov (Kazakh Mission to EU), Gulov (Tajik Mission to EU), Nurmetov (Uzbekistan Mission to EU)</p> <p>Forest (Frontline), Ivers (HRW), Fisher (HRW), Olhion (Ngo)</p> <p>Yatimov (Ambassador of Tajikistan to EU),</p>	
Secretaría de los Grupos políticos/Sekretariát politických skupin/Gruppernes sekretariat/Sekretariat der Fraktionen/Fraktsioonide sekretariaat/Γραμματεία των Πολιτικών Ομάδων/Sekretariats of political groups/Secrétariat des groupes politiques/Segreteria gruppi politici/Politisko grupu sekretariāts/Frakciju sekretoriai/Képviseletcsoportok titkársága/Segretarjat gruppi politici/Fractiesecretariaten/Sekretariat Grup Politycznych/Secr. dos grupos políticos/Sekretariát politických skupin/Sekretariat političnih skupin/Poliittisten ryhmien sihteeristöt/Gruppernas sekretariat	
PPE-DE PSE ALDE Verts/ALE GUE/NGL IND/DEM UEN NI	VAHL PERRIN RINALDI, BODARD DE CRAYENCOUR, BADGER, BERGAMASCHI
Gabinete del Presidente/Kancelář předsedy/Formandens Kabinet/Kabinett des Präsidenten/Presidendi kantselei/Γραφείο Προέδρου/President's Office/Cabinet du Président/Gabinetto del Presidente/Priekšsēdētāja kabinets/Pirmininko kabinetas/Elnöki hivatal/Kabinett tal-President/Kabinet van de Voorzitter/Gabinet Przewodniczącego/Gabinete do Presidente/Kancelária predsedu/Urad predsednika/Puhemiehen kabinetti/Talmanens kansli	
Gabinete del Secretario General/Kancelář generálního tajemníka/Generalsekretærens Kabinet/Kabinett des Generalsekretärs/Peasekretäri büroo/Γραφείο Γενικού Γραμματέα/Secretary-General's Office/Cabinet du Secrétaire général/Gabinetto del Segretario generale/Generālsēkretāra kabinets/Generalinio sekretoriaus kabinetas/Főtitkári hivatal/Kabinett tas-Segretarju Generali/Kabinet van de secretaris-generaal/Gabinet Sekretarza Generalnego/Gabinete do Secretário-Geral/Kancelária geralného tajomníka/Urad generalnega sekretarja/Pääsihteerin kabinetti/Generalsekreterarens kansli	

Dirección General/Generální ředitelství/Generaldirektorat/Generaldirektion/Peadirektoraat/Γενική Διεύθυνση/Directorate-General/Direction générale/Direzione generale/Ģenerāldirektorāts/Generalinis direktoratas/Főigazgatóság/Direttorat Generali/Direktoraten-generaal/Dyrekcja Generalna/Direcção-Geral/Generálne riaditeľstvo/Generalni direktorat/Pääosasto/Generaldirektorat	
DG PRES DG IPOL DG EXPO DG INFO DG PERS DG IFIN DG TRED DG FINS	
Servicio Jurídico/Právní služba/Juridisk Tjeneste/Juristischer Dienst/Õigusteenistus/Νομική Υπηρεσία/Legal Service/Service juridique/Servizio giuridico/Juridiskais dienests/Teisės tarnyba/Jogi szolgálat/Servizz legali/Juridische Dienst/Wydział prawny/Serviço Jurídico/Právny servis/Pravna služba/Oikeudellinen yksikkö/Rättstjänsten	
Secretaría de la comisión/Sekretariát výboru/Udvalgssekretariatet/Ausschusssekretariat/Komisjoni sekretariaat/Γραμματεία επιτροπής/Committee secretariat/Secrétariat de la commission/Segreteria della commissione/Komitejas sekretariāts/Komiteto sekretoriatas/A bizottság titkársága/Sekretarjat tal-kumitat/Commissiesecretariaat/Sekretariat komisji/Sekretariado da comissão/Sekretariat odbora/Valiokunnan sihteeristö/Utskottssekretariatet	
Boden	
Asistente/Asistent/Assistent/Assistenz/Βοηθός/Assistant/Assistente/Palīgs/Padējējas/assizstēns/Asystent/Pomočnik/Avustaja/Assistenten	
Mollet,	

- \* (P) = Presidente/Předseda/Formand/Vorsitzender/Esimees/Πρόεδρος/Chair(wo)man/Président/Priekšsēdētājs/Pirmininkas/Elnök/Chairman/Voorzitter/Przewodniczący/Předseda/Predsednik/Puheenjohtaja/Ordförande
- (VP) = Vicepresidente/Místopředseda/Næstformand/Stellvertretender Vorsitzender/Aseesimees/Αντιπρόεδρος/Vice-Chair(wo)man/Vice-Président/Priekšsēdētāja vietnieks/Pirmininko pavaduotojas/Alelnök/Víci 'Chairman'/Ondervoorzitter/Wiceprzewodniczący/Vice-Presidente/Podpredseda/Podpredsednik/Varapuheenjohtaja/Vice ordförande
- (M) = Miembro/Člen/Medlem./Mitglied/Parlamendiliige/Μέλος/Member/Membre/Membro/Deputāts/Narys/Tag/képviselő/Membru/Lid/Członek/Membro/Člen/Poslanec/Jāsen/Ledamot
- (F) = Funcionario/Úředník/Tjenestemand/Beamter/Ametnik/Υπάλληλος/Official/Fonctionnaire/Funzionario/Ierēdnis/Pareigūnas/Tisztviselő/Ufficjal/Ambtenaar/Urzędnik/Funcionário/Úradník/Uradnik/Virkamies/Tjänsteman